

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
Minutes of the September 14, 2004 Meeting
Page 1

A regular meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, September 14, 2004 in the City Hall Capitol Conference Room, 201 North Carson Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Vice Chairperson Mark Lopiccolo
Robert Darney
Louann Speulda

STAFF: Jennifer Pruitt, Senior Planner
Heidi Eskew-Herrmann, Planning Technician
Kathleen King, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A tape recording of these proceedings is on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office and is available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (1-0007) - Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present. Commissioners Baker, Ossa, and Smith were absent.

B. ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES - July 13, 2004, July 27, 2004, August 10, 2004 (1-0015) - Commissioner Speulda moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Darney seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

C. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (1-0022) - None.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTS (1-0027) - None.

E. DISCLOSURES (1-0032) - None.

F. PUBLIC HEARING ACTION ITEMS:

F-1. HRC 04-161 ACTION REGARDING AN APPLICATION FROM JACK KURT (PROPERTY OWNER: EDWARDS HOUSE, LLC), TO ALLOW REPLACEMENT OF WINDOW SASHES, THE INSTALLATION OF A NEW EXTERIOR DOOR AND STEPS ON THE NORTHERN FAÇADE, AND DEMOLITION OF THE SANDSTONE WALL ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 204 NORTH MINNESOTA STREET, APN 003-192-09 (1-0037) - Ms. Pruitt distributed written comments from Commissioner Ossa to the Commissioners and staff. She advised of having conducted a site visit with the property owner to review the proposed project. She referred to the site plan included in the agenda materials, and narrated slides in conjunction with details of the proposed project. She read Commissioner Ossa's written comments into the record.

Jack Kurt discussed the deteriorated condition of the existing windows, and his preference to replace them with triple-pane windows. He acknowledged that interior grids are available for the triple-pane windows, and advised that he had no problem with using beige grids. In response to a question, he advised that 21 windows in the original structure would be replaced. In response to a further question, he expressed the

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 14, 2004 Meeting

Page 2

opinion that repairing or reglazing the existing windows would be impossible. He read a letter into the record from Megan Keller, an upstairs tenant, who has complained about the condition of the existing windows. Commissioner Speulda encouraged Mr. Kurt to consider repairing some of the windows, especially on the façade. She offered to provide National Park Service information with regard to the same.

Mr. Kurt discussed proposed installation of a new exterior door and steps on the northern façade. In response to a question, he discussed the impossibility of installing the door in the addition. Chairperson Drews expressed concern with regard to cutting the sandstone. Mr. Kurt explained that he is a mason and has worked with sandstone in the past. He discussed the method by which he will reuse the sandstone from the wall for the door threshold and the steps. He acknowledged his intention to replace the porch windows, and that he would consider applying storm windows instead. He noted that this would create a "difference in terms of look between the upstairs and the downstairs." He acknowledged a preference to retain the original glass, but discussed the issues of cleaning and energy efficiency.

Vice Chairperson Lopiccio advised of personally touring the house several months ago. He confirmed that the existing windows are "too far gone" to repair. In response to a question, Mr. Kurt explained the method by which the new windows will be installed. Vice Chairperson Lopiccio explained how to install the windows without removing any trim. Discussion took place with regard to the same, and Commissioner Darney suggested including a condition of approval that the trim not be disturbed during installation.

Commissioner Darney expressed support for installation of the kitchen door as long as the exterior trim is maintained, and for reusing the sandstone. In response to a question, Mr. Kurt advised that, if the Building Department requires a balustrade on the back steps, it would be similar in design and material to that which is on the front steps. He advised that the same front door design will be used for the back door. He discussed the possibility of putting a transom at the top of the door if he is unable to find a 104" door. In response to a question, Mr. Kurt advised that the window opening will not be widened. He acknowledged that the block will be popped out below and the edges roughened. The granite window sill will be dropped down to serve as the threshold. He advised that unless the Building Department requires it, he will not install a balustrade at the back door steps.

Commissioner Darney moved to approve HRC 04-161, a request from Jack Kurt (owner, Edwards House LLC) regarding the window sashes replacement and addition of an exterior door located at 204 Minnesota Street with the stipulations that the exterior trim be maintained as original as much as possible, and that any additional balustrades, if required, would match the existing railings on the house or be in context. Vice Chairperson Lopiccio seconded the motion. Mr. Kurt acknowledged his agreement with the stipulations. Chairperson Drews called for a vote on the pending motion; **motion carried 4-0.**

Ms. Pruitt distributed informational materials on proposed art work to be delivered to the Edwards House, and consensus of the Commission was to agendaize, for a future meeting, discussion of historic district policies with regard to the same.

F-2. HRC 04-082 ACTION REGARDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR AN APPLICATION FROM JOYCE HARRINGTON REGARDING PORCH AND FAÇADE TREATMENTS, INCLUDING DECKING, ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 408 WEST ROBINSON STREET, APN 003-236-01 (1-0562) - Ms. Pruitt provided background information on this item, and narrated slides of the subject structure. In response to a question, she read into the record the Commission's action taken at the May 11, 2004 meeting. She read Commissioner Ossa's written comments into the record, and advised of having e-mailed photographs to her. Ms. Pruitt noted the attachment to

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
Minutes of the September 14, 2004 Meeting
Page 3

Commissioner Ossa's written comments of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and read into the record those which Commissioner Ossa considered most pertinent, numbers 2, 5, 6, 9, and 10.

Joyce Harrington discussed her understanding that the use of brick had been previously approved by the Commission. She reviewed revisions to the porch, and advised that the original porch railing was ten inches shorter than is currently required by the Building Code. She advised of discovering two half-rotted 1"x4" planks under the porch which were supporting "a ton and a half of concrete," and at that point deciding to stabilize the porch structure. She discussed research into 1900s Craftsman bungalow houses, and advised that many had brick masonry on the front façades. She suggested that there will be less brick than "if we had just bricked over that structure as is ..." She further suggested that "it probably looks grandiose at the moment because all the plants are gone." She advised that the landscape would be replaced to offset the porch, and that the house would be painted. She displayed samples of the brick and flagstone materials, and advised that the flagstone will only be installed in the walkways.

Ms. Harrington advised that steps on both sides of the house, which were also found to be rotten, have been removed. New footings have been poured and, in replacing the balusters, "the brick would follow up the side of it . . . in small quantities" to balance out the brick on the whole house. Ms. Harrington advised that she is still shopping for balusters and welcomed the Commissioners' input. She expressed the opinion that once the landscape is replaced, "it will all balance out." She reiterated the understanding that "even more brick" had already been approved, and apologized for moving ahead of the process.

Chairperson Drews explained that asking Ms. Harrington to return to the Commission indicated the Commissioners' desire to review the proposed brick material and discuss it further prior to approving it. Ms. Harrington noted that brick was depicted on the original drawings. Chairperson Drews advised that the Commissioners purposely delayed a decision on the brick. He pointed out that the work having already been started places everyone in a bad position. He agreed with Commissioner Ossa's comments that the work done to date changes the appearance and massing of the structure. He advised that the work does not comply with Carson City's Historic District standards or the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. He discussed the difficult position the Commission is placed in when requested to approve work which has already been started.

In response to a question, Chairperson Drews reviewed items 2, 5, 6, 9, and 10 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. With regard to standard #2, he advised that the front porch had been altered, thereby redefining the feature and the space. Chairperson Drews advised that the Carson City Historic District Guidelines mirror the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Commissioner Speulda noted that the scale and massing of the dormer addition was compatible; the porch is now out of character. Commissioner Darney expressed the opinion that the brick is not as much a concern as the massing and scale of the piers. He expressed support for the handicap lift. He acknowledged that the addition of any brick would be considered an alteration of the porch feature. He advised that flagstone is another material which would be alien to the site, and suggested natural concrete which is prevalent throughout the neighborhood. Discussion took place regarding the possibility of painting the brick and changing the appearance of the pillars.

In response to a question, Chairperson Drews explained that the State Historic Preservation Office ("SHPO") annually reviews the actions of the Commission in conjunction with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as a determining factor in whether the City should keep its certified local government ("CLG") status. Ms. Pruitt acknowledged that the Standards for Rehabilitation are guidelines, but noted the importance of enforcing them for the sake of the City's CLG status. She advised that there are only four CLGs in Nevada and explained the repercussions of losing CLG status.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 14, 2004 Meeting

Page 4

Chairperson Drews discussed the declining integrity of the Comstock Historic District, over the past 15 years, as a result of not adhering to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Discussion took place regarding the appropriate action, and Commissioner Darney requested that the applicant submit more comprehensive drawings for the next meeting. Discussion took place regarding possible solutions, and Ms. Pruitt offered to request Commissioner Ossa to meet with Ms. Harrington at the site.

Commissioner Darney moved to continue HRC 04-082 to a future Commission meeting. Commissioner Speulda seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

F-3. DISCUSSION REGARDING CLG GRANTS (1-1306) - Ms. Pruitt advised that the consultant has provided all the necessary documentation and materials to finalize the East Side Historic Inventory. Planning and Community Development Department staff are in the process of putting together the grant package. SHPO representatives preliminarily reviewed the documentation last week, and Ms. Pruitt anticipates that the package will be delivered to SHPO by Thursday, September 16th. With regard to the existing grant, SHPO Historic Preservation Specialist Rebecca Ossa has requested additional information from the Planning and Community Development Department to establish an account.

Ms. Pruitt requested the Commissioners to provide input on the Historic District Guidelines update. Chairperson Drews advised that "Historic Architecture Review Commission" should be globally replaced. Ms. Pruitt advised that a draft will be prepared for the Commissioners' review. She anticipates that the project will be completed by the end of the year.

Ms. Pruitt advised of having met with GIS Coordinator Scott Royal and Battalion Chief Stacey Giomi regarding the software package discussed at the last Commission meeting. Discussion took place regarding the cost. In response to a question, Chairperson Drews advised that the software company retains ownership of the product and the photographs. Licensing would be City-wide and available to any department. Ms. Pruitt advised that she would check with Ms. Ossa to determine if this software package can be included in the grant funding application. Chairperson Drews suggested doing the photography during the winter. Ms. Pruitt will check into funding opportunities and provide a status report at the next Commission meeting.

F-4. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED WITHIN THE INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT ON BOARDS, COMMISSIONS, AND COMMITTEES, SPECIFICALLY HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION RECOMMENDATIONS (1-1430) - Ms. Pruitt provided background information on this item, and advised that the audit report was presented to the Board of Supervisors at their September 2nd meeting. She distributed the audit results to the Commissioners and staff, and reviewed the recommendations. Chairperson Drews acknowledged that Internal Auditor Steve Wolkomir had contacted him and reviewed the audit report. He advised Mr. Wolkomir that the technical disciplines represented on the Commission are mandated as part of the City's CLG status. He suggested that these would be difficult to duplicate if the Commission were to be consolidated with the Planning Commission, as suggested by Mr. Wolkomir.

Commissioner Darney agreed with earlier comments by Ms. Pruitt that the Commissioners provide assistance and direction to applicants which is more specific than that which is available in the Historic District Guidelines or the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Discussion took place regarding the importance of community service. Ms. Pruitt provided an overview of the discussion which

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 14, 2004 Meeting

Page 5

took place at the September 2nd Board of Supervisors meeting. She pointed out that the last appeal of a Commission decision to the Board of Supervisors was the Olcovich House. Chairperson Drews requested Ms. Pruitt to continue inviting the Supervisors and City Manager Linda Ritter to attend Commission meetings.

G. FUTURE COMMISSION ITEMS (1-1755) - Ms. Pruitt advised that the question regarding artwork would be agendized for a future meeting, and a brief discussion took place with regard to the same. Commissioner Speulda inquired as to previous decisions regarding the structure at 311 Washington Street, and Ms. Pruitt advised that she would agendize the matter for a future Commission meeting.

H. INTERNAL COMMUNICATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS:

H-1. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM STAFF (1-1900) - Ms. Pruitt introduced Ms. Eskew-Herrmann, and provided background information on her qualifications and experience.

H-2. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS (1-1873) - None.

I. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (1-1915) - Commissioner Speulda moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:12 p.m. Commissioner Darney seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

The Minutes of the September 14, 2004 meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission are so approved this 12th day of October, 2004.

MICHAEL DREWS, Chair