

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 1

DRAFT

A regular meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, May 14, 2009 in the Community Center Sierra Room, 851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Vice Chairperson Robert Darney
Commissioner Derwin Bass
Commissioner Mark Lopiccolo
Commissioner Rebecca Ossa

STAFF: Lee Plemel, Planning Director
Jennifer Pruitt, Senior Planner
Jano Barnhurst, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the Commission's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record, on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office. These materials are available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (5:30:04) - Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present. Commissioners Hayes and Speulda were absent.

B. ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES (5:30:31) - Commissioner Darney moved to approve the minutes of the April 9, 2009 meeting as written. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 5-0.

C. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (5:31:00) - None.

D. DISCLOSURES (5:31:16) - Commissioner Lopiccolo disclosed that he built a house for the Taggarts.

E. PUBLIC COMMENTS (5:31:38) - None.

F. PUBLIC HEARING MATTERS:

F-1. HRC-09-041 ACTION TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FROM KURT GARRETT TO ADD AN 8/12 PITCH TO AN EXISTING FLAT ROOF SECTION AND TO ALLOW THE RE-ROOFING OF THE REMAINING RESIDENCE, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO), LOCATED AT 314 WEST ROBINSON STREET, APN 003-286-06 (5:32:12) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record. She narrated slides for the Commission and advised that Applicant provided a sample of the proposed material. In response to a question by Mr. Garrett, Ms. Pruitt advised that the property is zoned RO which is primarily a residential zoning district but also allows an office and there is a historical overlay. The zoning is correct and appropriate. She advised that she will e-mail additional information regarding residential office zoning and appropriate uses to Mr. Garrett. Mr. Garrett advised that next year he will submit plans for re-siding and new windows. In response to a question regarding a dentil molding, Mr.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 2

DRAFT

Garrett replied that there is aluminum siding, no detail, but would like to do it in the future. In response to another question, he replied that a roof sample was provided in a dark mesa brown. In response to another question, he replied that the roofing material is presidential grand canyon which is better than a 50 year roof. In response to another question, he replied that it is a traditional shingle roof. In response to another question, he replied that a lot of leaves gather in the back and he is trying to get the snow load and leaves off and do an 8/12 pitch to match. The pitch itself is very steep and he wanted to give it some steepness without going too steep. Chairperson Drews called for further questions and public comment and hearing none, entertained a motion. **Vice Chairperson Darney moved to approve HRC-09-041, a request from Kurt Garrett, for the installation of a gable roof on the existing addition of a single family dwelling unit, on the eastern portion of the subject site, on property zoned Residential Office, located at 314 West Robinson Street, APN 003-286-06, subject to the conditions of approval contained in the staff report. Commissioner Bass seconded the motion. Motion carried 5-0.**

F-2. HRC-09-042 ACTION TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FROM CAROL ANDERSEN TO REPLACE THE EXISTING CHAIN LINK FENCE WITH A FOUR FOOT IN HEIGHT WOOD VICTORIAN STYLE PICKET FENCE, FRONT GATE AND DOUBLE GATE ACROSS THE DRIVEWAY, ON PROPERTY ZONED SINGLE FAMILY 6000 (SF6), LOCATED AT 710 ELIZABETH STREET, APN 003-272-09. (5:40:10) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record. She narrated photos for the Commission. In response to a question, Ms. Andersen replied that the fence would be white and in exactly the same location as the chain link fence. There will be a 6-8 inch baseboard under the fence to restrain small animals and the posts will be 4x4s. Chairperson Drews called for further questions and public comment and hearing none, entertained a motion. Commissioner Lopiccolo moved to approve HRC-09-042, a request from Carol Andersen, for the installation of a wood fencing material (3 to 4 feet in overall height, approximately 71 lineal feet) on the eastern portion of the subject site, on property zoned Single Family 6,000, located at 710 Elizabeth Street, APN 003-272-09, subject to the conditions of approval contained in the staff report. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 5-0.

F-3. HRC-09-031 ACTION TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FROM SONIA TAGGART (PROPERTY OWNER: EVEREST HOLDING, LLC) TO REMOVE EXISTING SASH WINDOWS AND REPLACE WITH WOOD CLAD OR VINYL WINDOWS, ON PROPERTY ZONED MIXED USE RESIDENTIAL (MUR), LOCATED AT 108 NORTH MINNESOTA STREET, APN 003-204-01. (5:44:02) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record, and narrated slides for the Commission. Paul Taggart advised that he and his wife are the property owners. In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt advised that the building is not on the National Register. In response to a question, Mr. Taggart replied that they want to replace the windows exactly the way they look now but there's a cost issue associated with the two bids. Both are great products and go right in the historic frame. He loves the windows the way they are but wants to be more consistent. He'd like to replace the upper windows with the same type of grid. The back bay and front bay windows have different grids and would like to do them all the same. In response to a question, Commissioner Ossa replied that she would need to look at the house and the history of the building to determine different styles of windows. Commissioner Lopiccolo commented that he would like to see one over ones. Mr. Taggart responded that he would be willing to do that on all the windows. Another bay window is on the other side of the house, and would prefer to do them all that way. Vice Chairperson Darney would like to see them all the same on the ground floor and all the same on the top floor. Mr. Taggart advised that there are two

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 3

DRAFT

windows on each side of the front door and can do the same thing. In response to a question, Mr. Taggart replied that the window in the top is narrower than the rest. He wants to put trim around that window because it's cut into stone. Commissioner Ossa commented that perhaps the top one could stay without the pane as it's so much narrower than the ones below. Mr. Taggart stated that the bottom floor could all be done in two over twos and that particular window could be done one over one with the dormers six over six. The window in back isn't part of the original building but also needs to be changed. In response to a question, Mr. Taggart replied that the preferred material is determined by price. Wood and vinyl both do the same thing. Vinyl has an aluminum frame that gives it the structure that wood would have. In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt replied that the HRC has previously approved triple pane vinyl windows on the Edwards House. Chairperson Drews commented that he would prefer wood as it's a compatible material with the building. "This building is pretty distinctive and if it's not on the National Register it's certainly eligible for it, so the closer we stick to original materials, the better off we'd be if you ever wanted to go with a National Register designation." In response to a question, Mr. Taggart replied that the Low E is clear glass. Commissioner Lopiccio advised that a wood window is going to have a vinyl or steel clad on the outside so it's going to look exactly the same. Commissioner Ossa commented that vinyl is not environmentally friendly and was concerned with how to repair it when it breaks whereas metal can be hammered out. Chairperson Drews called for further questions and public comment. Dan Cowan who works for Capital Glass commented that the difference between wood and vinyl is huge. Wood is good, but vinyl is also. Wood shrinks and swells all the time. Local temperatures range from 0 to 100 degrees but weather doesn't affect the longevity of vinyl. Hearing no further public comment, Chairperson Drews entertained a motion. **Vice Chairperson Darney moved to approve HRC-09-031, a request from Sonia Taggart (property owner: Everest Holding, LLC), to allow installation and replacement of windows, on property zoned Mixed-Use Residential (MUR), located at 108 N. Minnesota Street, APN 003-204-01, subject to the conditions of approval contained in the staff report. Commissioner Lopiccio seconded the motion. Vice Chairperson Darney clarified that the ground floor be two over two divided light and the upper dormer windows be six over six with the exception being the front window which will be one over one, and the matching back window. Commissioner Lopiccio seconded the clarification. Motion carried 5-0.**

F-4. HRC-08-122 ACTION TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FROM ART HANNAFIN (PROPERTY OWNERS: JACK AND SHERYL MCLAUGHLIN) FOR THE ADDITION OF A TWO CAR GARAGE AND THE RENOVATION OF THE SECOND FLOOR AND ADDITION WITH THE EXTERIOR MATERIALS AND STYLE OF DESIGN TO MATCH EXISTING RESIDENCE, ON PROPERTY ZONED SINGLE FAMILY 6000 (SF6), LOCATED AT 611 WEST ROBINSON STREET, APN 003-243-01. (5:57:10) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record. She advised that since the item was reviewed by the HRC in 2008, plans have changed and there is no longer a third story element of the proposed addition. The previous building height was 27 feet but is now proposed at 24 feet. She then narrated slides and advised that the proposed addition does not meet the required setbacks but the applicant has applied for a variance. If approved today, the setback variance will go before the Planning Division in June.

Art Hannafin advised that he has been trying to improve the house for a number of years. A wrap around porch was extended several years ago. There is no parking on site but many owners of older homes have come before the HRC to request two car garages. There would be a 20x20 two car garage on the southwest corner and a usable space above it on the second floor. It sits 2'6" off the rear yard which will not interfere

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 4

DRAFT

with existing foundations on a nearby garage and carport and will allow room to walk past the garage to the rear yard without going through the garage. The face of the garage will be located on the property line. The addition on the western elevation extends and makes more livable space on the ground floor and adds a master bedroom on the second floor. The roof extends several feet above the existing ridge line to allow for an eight foot ceiling. The ceiling height and rest of the house is about seven feet and the owners want at least eight feet in the second floor bathroom. The same materials would be used as in the existing house which is one of the more colorful houses in the neighborhood. In response to a question, Mr. Hannafin replied that the garage wall on the south is offset so that the garage portion is 2'6" and extends back another six inches for offset so the shape of the gable end remains. No windows are shown on the 2'6" wall because of code requirements. In response to a question, Mr. Hannafin replied that the upper middle addition could be a gable instead of blending into the existing structure. Vice Chairperson Darney commented that the second story over the garage is out in the street and is concerned about the physical scale over the garage. Mr. Hannafin replied that he has seen them similarly and will stipulate to the gabling. Commissioner Ossa inquired if the dormer above the garage could be tucked in and shingles run in front of the window to be more integrated into the roof. Mr. Hannafin replied he would stipulate to it. Vice Chairperson Darney agreed and commented that it would help the scale at the street. In response to a question, Mr. Hannafin replied that there wouldn't be any egress issues with the windows. In response to another question, Mr. Hannafin replied that because of the overhang, the setback would be about two feet. Commissioner Ossa was concerned that the new addition on the north elevation looks like a plain big surface and needs something to balance the window on the gable end and suggested a decorative or faux window. Mr. Hannafin replied that the area is a bathroom with a spa tub. Chairperson Drews called for public comment but there was none. He thanked Mr. Hannafin for working with the HRC. Commissioner Ossa inquired if the property owner selected a garage door as the plans show a modern door. Vice Chairperson Darney suggested stipulating to a carriage style door as opposed to a modern horizontal line door. Chairperson Drews entertained a motion. **Vice Chairperson Darney moved to approve HRC-08-122, a request from Art Hannafin, to allow a major addition of a two car garage, with minor additions of a new office area and expanded entrance area on the first floor, with the addition of a second floor, new bathroom and storage area, to an existing single family dwelling unit, on property located at 611 West Robinson Street, APN 003-243-01, subject to the conditions of approval contained in the staff report in addition to the comments made by Commission members referring to the style of the garage door being a carriage style garage door and modification of the dormer above the garage to a setback to allow for the dutch gable type of roof and a dormer gable end for the center master bathroom intersects existing roof and a decorative window in the north elevation of the master bathroom. Commissioner Lopiccolo seconded the motion. Chairperson Drews asked Mr. Hannafin if he agreed to the stipulations and he replied in the affirmative. Motion carried 5-0.**

F-5. HRC-09-043 DISCUSSION ONLY OF A CONCEPTUAL PLAN FOR AN EXTERIOR, FREESTANDING COLUMBARIUM WALL AND MEMORIAL GARDEN PRESENTED BY ST. PETER'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO) AND LOCATED AT 305 NORTH MINNESOTA STREET, APN 003-201-01. (6:13:06) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record. She narrated photos for the Commission. Halle Murphy introduced herself as a member of St. Peter's parish and thanked the Commission for their service to the community. She then introduced several members of the parish who were in the audience. She asked the Commission, "what do you value about St. Peters and what is our relationship with the rest of the historic district?" Chairperson Drews replied that this came out when the Presbyterian Church did their expansion project which is part of the historic district

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 5

DRAFT

and is the center of the spiritual side of Carson City. There's a special relationship with the churches that are relatively open, large blocks and wants to see it continue as a part of the whole district. He didn't want to see massive development, but continue with the openness. That is how it relates to the district and the historic structure report brought out the architectural value of the church. Development should stay within the style of the rectory and church. Vice Chairperson Darney added that of all the exposure he has had to the church, he has been uninspired by no one using its beautiful green lawn. "What you've approached here is extremely valuable in that regard of using valuable yard that seems to be a waste at the moment with the people in your church that they should be able to get out and enjoy that part of the property." Chairperson Drews commented that in San Francisco there was a large columbarium near his school which was a neat place to relax and meditate. "There's a big open space of grass there that could be used and available to the community and think about where we fit." Ms. Murphy thanked them for their responses and stated that it was encouraging to find out from the Historic Structural Review Report that the rectory building is in much better shape than originally thought. Comments made about the relationship of the buildings and references to courtyards gave them hope to use the property better without destroying the elements that make it beautiful. This had a huge effect on the columbarium plan as it was originally planned for the north side of the rectory. She then asked, "what is your first impression of St. Peters from the street?" Commissioner Lopiccolo replied that it's beautiful; he's lived here 32 years and is probably one of his favorite churches. It has a nice presence and he loves the height. Commissioner Ossa commented that she sees the beautiful tall, white building aspiring to the sky and the lawn around it really sets the building and frames it. Vice Chairperson Darney agreed with the beautiful lawn area but stated that the way the two buildings relate to each other doesn't allow for use by the congregation. Being such a large area, anything added that would draw people into it would be beneficial. He appreciates the simplicity of the Early American style architecture that is becoming rare in small towns. "There's not many left and this one's in fine condition and should be a benefit to our community for years to come." Commissioner Bass advised that the columbariums he has designed have always been circular - "the wholeness of life, the cycle of life - all those things that give that, so I don't have a problem with the circular plan." Ms. Murphy stated that the lawn is an energy and water waster and rubs against the grain of the community to pour resources into something that looks marginal at best. "It looks good from twenty feet away, but any closer and it's obvious that it's half grass and other green stuff." Their motivation is to utilize the space and draw people into it, to celebrate the outdoors and the church's legacy, and a reduction in their water bill.

Ms. Murphy called the Commission's attention to page 7 of the report showing the area of the property on which they plan to build. She explained that the small window is in the sacristy which stores sacred items. Any blessed wine remaining after worship is poured into the sink which then goes out underneath that window into the open air. It's part of their liturgy, creates a holy space outside and takes what is sacred on the inside to the outside and in the air. Having that corner and the columbarium encompassing the space is important to the project. The columbarium is a free standing wall, arched in a quarter circle that embraces the holy space. The tree is encompassed by an open air prayer garden. In response to a question, Ms. Murphy replied that the tree fits in the center of the columbarium and will transform the space into a sheltered open air courtyard. Their approach with the architect was to make it fit the building. "The feel of the scale was much more important than the spaces we were going to get out of it." They are not yet in the engineering phase, so have only provided rough measurement figures. The dimensions are proportional to existing structures, materials incorporated and architectural details based on the recommendations of the historic survey. In response to a question, Ms. Murphy replied that they want a place for air movement but secluded and somewhat private from street and sidewalk traffic. The exterior finish should be

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 6

DRAFT

complementary to the church structure with little to no maintenance. Commissioner Bass commented that Project Manager Dennis Freitas is a friend and suggested he bring in his 3D model which would be very helpful for the general public to understand the concept. Chairperson Drews inquired whether they will be using cinder block. He commented that the Veterans Memorial has massive blocks of sandstone that would give the texture of the foundation. The cinder blocks mimic the sandstone. Commissioner Bass advised that it is not a cinder block pattern, and opined that they are trying to emulate a masonry product and the actual development will come forward as they further the study. Chairperson Drews suggested repeating the textures and materials already in use on the building. Commissioner Ossa commented that she likes the use of masonry in reflecting the foundation of the church in the columbarium but wonders about the proportions of the columns and whether they should be masonry or wood. "I just feel like this white trellis wood structure is just floating up there and it might be because of the pattern that was pasted in from the software program but the columns seem really massive for this structure." Vice Chairperson Darney agreed with the cut sandstone style masonry mimicking the foundation but it may be top heavy. "From the design, it has a wood post every other post and those wood posts are quite attractive but wonder if the architect could study using a lighter post at the top end as opposed to carrying the masonry all the way up which has a lot of weight and is not reflected in the building itself of wood and clapboard." Commissioner Bass echoed Vice Chairperson Darney's comments and "echos the spire in the church by having more slender elements to support the pergola." In response to a comment, Commissioner Bass clarified his comment by stating, "the columns shown between the masonry end blocks of the columbarium sections - stop the masonry at the top of whatever that height was for the surround for the columbarium and then carry that on up with the wood column to meet the wood beam or pergola above." Chairperson Drews commented that what adds to the mass is the beams look like they're 4x8 and the design mimics the detail on the church which is slender and gothic, so things should be scaled down. He then called for public comment. Jed Block thanked Ms. Murphy and the congregation for coming forth and watching and learning what's been going on in the neighborhood and he also thanked the HRC for their studies. "It's nice to feel like there's good stewards of our heritage in town and a welcoming place that welcomes the community as a whole and doesn't do anything other than beautify our surroundings and add architectural significance to our wonderful town. It's amazing how they thought in 1890 that they might expand so they bought the rectory building. This church obviously has some forward thinking." Chairperson Drews thanked Ms. Murphy and asked if anyone on the Commission would like to help them through the process. "It'd be a whole lot easier if we give you input as you're doing it rather than back and forth." Commissioner Ossa and Vice Chairperson Darney volunteered to help. Chairperson Drews commented that they have great expertise which will help in the design process. Commissioner Bass commented that they also have expertise in the company they've hired. Ms. Murphy expressed her thanks to the Commission.

F-6. DISCUSSION ONLY REGARDING AN UPDATE OF CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT GRANT 32-08-21733(3), CARSON CITY MID CENTURY SURVEY, PHASE II, CARSON CITY CONTEXT AND TRAINING OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE HRC AND RESIDENTS OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT. (6:40:20) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt gave a staff report. Consultant Diana Painter has provided a draft of the survey work and will be here the week of May 28 to complete work for the context and make any needed changes to the survey work. She will also be attending the presentation on the 28th. Everything is on track regarding the grant work and draft. Chairperson Drews commented that he is still reviewing the draft.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 7

DRAFT

G. STAFF REPORTS

COMMISSIONER REPORTS/COMMENTS (6:41:54) - Chairperson Drews commented that with the economic stimulus package it appears that the Department of Energy and Environmental Protection don't have to abide by Section 106. Last week at the Governor's request, Public Works began installing solar panels on the Capitol building without any 106 review. It is a National Register building and there are more appropriate places to put them but it is apparently legal and federal guidelines don't have to be followed by all federal agencies. He urged everyone to write to their representatives in Washington to let them know that if there are congressional acts to protect historical resources, they need to be protected by all federal agencies. The panels have been installed on the hip roofs on the south and east sides of the dome with plans for more. Public Works suggested alternative locations to the Governor, but he insisted they go on the Capitol building. "I've written to state and U.S. representatives to let them know what I think and it's something they have to be aware of. When the FCC started allowing permits for cell towers, it became apparent that they had to comply with section 106 to do the architectural and archeological effects. We need to do the same with these other two agencies." He explained that Section 106 is a review process to make sure that any activities occurring with federal funds don't destroy historic resources either archeologically or architecturally. It is a process of evaluating a structure or site affected by the development and figuring out ways to mitigate them while being sensitive to the resource. In response to a question, Chairperson Drews replied that if no federal money is involved, nothing can stop him and that state projects come to the HRC as a courtesy. This was fast tracked and had to be completed by June 1st. He asked Ron James to set up a meeting with SHPO, State Lands and Public Works as he is unsure what authority the HRC may have. Everyone he's talked to has said that the Department of Energy does not have to comply with these kinds of projects. Commissioner Bass commented that the beauty of solar panels is they can be removed and there are subsequent paint materials that will be photovoltaic, so the dome could be painted silver and used as a photo cell. Chairperson Drews agreed and said when he talked with them, he realized that they could be approved because they are removable, but the process is still violated. "Someone thinks they can do what they want with a building that's in the National Trust like that. It bothers me."

Commissioner Ossa mentioned that the Historic Preservation Fund applications have not been officially reviewed as they are waiting for the legislature to close out of budgets. There has to be matching funds to share with the federal funding.

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT TO THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION (6:47:51) - Chairperson Drews introduced the item and Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report which is incorporated into the record. She advised that May is Historic Preservation Month. A request from Edward and Maureen Waterhouse for a historical tax deferral was before the Board of Supervisors (BOS) on May 7th and approved. John Lambert's presentation of the proper care and treatment of historic masonry buildings will be at 5:30 on May 28 in the BAC Performance Hall. The Planning Division sent out notices to everyone with property in the district and can be contacted with any questions regarding the presentation. In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt replied that the matter does not need to be agendized since it's a presentation.

There was a news article on May 7th regarding the Historic Preservation Awards which will be presented by Chairperson Drews and Mayor Crowell at the BOS meeting on May 21 at 8:30. Former Mayor Marv Teixeira and the Waterhouses will receive awards.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Meeting

Page 8

DRAFT

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS (6:50:42) - Ms. Pruitt advised of an application for a siding project on a historic home in the district which will be before the Commission on July 9th.

H. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (6:51:17) - Commissioner Ossa moved to adjourn the meeting at 6:51 p.m. Commissioner Lopiccolo seconded the motion. Motion carried 5-0.

The Minutes of the May 14, 2009 Carson City Historic Resources Commission meeting are so approved this _____ day of June, 2009.

MICHAEL DREWS, Chair