MINUTES

Regular Meeting

Carson City Board of Equalization Tuesday, February 6, 2018 ● 9:00 AM Community Center Sierra Room

851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada

Board Members:

Chair – Jed Block Member – Carson McFadden Member – Jill Rasner Member – Roy Semmens

Member - Mallory Wilson

Staff:

Dave Dawley, Assessor Adriana Fralick, Chief Deputy District Attorney Kimberly Adams, Chief Deputy Assessor Denise Gillott, Chief Property Appraiser Donald Massow, Property Appraiser Jeremy Saposnek, Property Appraiser Tamar Warren, Deputy Clerk

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the Board's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record. These materials are on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office, and available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM

(9:02:00) – Chairperson Block called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. Roll was called. A quorum was present.

| Attendee Name | Status | Arrived/Left |
|------------------------|---------|--------------|
| Chairperson Jed Block | Present | |
| Member Carson McFadden | Present | |
| Member Jill Rasner | Present | |
| Member Roy Semmens | Present | |
| Member Mallory Wilson | Present | |

B. PUBLIC COMMENT

(9:02:33) – Chairperson Block entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming. Mr. Dawley thanked the Board members for volunteering their time to serve on the Board of Equalization. He also noted that agenda Item I will be reagendized for a later date.

C. CARSON CITY BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEMBER ORIENTATION

(9:03:31) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Dawley noted that there had not been any Board of Equalization (BOE) law changes. He also outlined the process by which the appeals will be heard, stating that the appellant would present first, then the Assessor's Office would outline the Assessor's Evidence, after which there was room for the appellant's rebuttal, followed by discussion and a decision by the Board of Equalization [in the form of a motion].

(9:04:29) – Ms. Fralick reviewed the responsibilities of the Board members and noted that they are a quasi-judicial body that makes decisions and not a body that functions in and advisory capacity. She also reviewed the Open Meeting Law rules and cautioned against "walking quorums" and against "serial communication". Ms. Fralick urged members to notify her of any possible conflicts of interest, reviewed the disclosure process, and offered to send information and links regarding any of the statutes.

D. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR WILLIAM M. PIERCY, 4137 KINGS CANYON ROAD, APN 007-072-04

(9:12:46) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Ms. Fralick swore in the Assessor's Office representatives and all the appellants that would testify before the Board that day. Mr. Massow gave background on the property and presented the Assessor's Evidence which is incorporated into the record. He also noted that the value change stipulation had been agreed upon both by the appellant and the Assessor's Office, adding that based on the age of the subject property, the current cap is lower than the actual proposed value change which will not change Mr. Piercy's tax base; however, Mr. Piercy had requested documenting the information.

(9:18:31) – Appellant Bill Piercy introduced himself and indicated that he agreed with the Assessor's Office information, except for the fact that the property was not purchased at an auction and was listed by a broker; therefore, it was an Arm's Length transaction. He noted that he had purchased it for one of his sons for \$454,000 in June [2017] and hoped for further reductions. Chairperson Block received confirmation that the stipulation agreement had been signed by Mr. Piercy; however, he was requesting additional reductions in value and a possible postponement of the decision to a further date. Ms. Fralick clarified that the agreement is not effective until it is approved by this Board and Mr. Dawley noted that the item could be postponed until the February 20, 2018 BOE meeting.

(9:21:37) – Member Wilson was informed by Mr. Piercy that he did not have an appraisal as he had paid cash for the property. He added that the property was in "a great neighborhood" for his son and grandchild. Mr. Dawley clarified that the property, listed on Realtor.com, and was "in distress", and noted that Mr. Piercy had "done a lot to bring it up to market value and to make it livable"; however, "we don't value property based on what it sold for" and believed their values were not going to change. Member Semmens noted a discrepancy in the parcel numbers in the agenda materials and Mr. Massow verified that the correct parcel number was 007-072-04. Ms. Fralick recommended highlighting the correct parcel number during the Board's decision motion. Member Wilson inquired about the progress made with the repairs and Mr. Piercy stated that his son was performing the repairs himself and had a full-time job; therefore, he anticipated that it would take "a long time", adding that he had dome some work, such as installing window sills, himself since the purchase of the property. Chairperson Block was informed that the mold in the garage had not yet been removed. Member Wilson requested postponement of the decision to the next meeting to give her the opportunity to review comparables. Mr. Dawley noted that the next meeting was planned for February 20, 2018. There were no public comments. Chairperson Block entertained a motion.

(9:28:54) – MOTION: Member Wilson moved to postpone [a decision on] item D to the next meeting on February 20 [2018]. The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Motion carried 5-0-0.

E. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR RIZZA, ROBERT J. AND KATHLEEN M., 3451 COMBS CANYON ROAD, APN 007-091-91.

(9:29:29) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Massow presented the Assessor's Evidence and noted that a value change stipulation agreement between the appellant and the Assessor's Office had already been signed, and requested Board approval. Mr. Dawley clarified that the construction was placed on the roll after the 2017 Board of Equalization meetings; therefore both the 2017/2018 and 2018/2019 taxable values were being presented for consideration. Chairperson Block noted that the appellant was not present. Mr. Massow clarified for Member Wilson that the obsolescence adjustment was a rounding adjustment. There were no public comments. Chairperson Block entertained a motion.

(9:36:50) – MOTION: Member Mc Fadden moved to accept the value change stipulation agreement for APN 007-091-91 with the 2017/2018 taxable value reduced from \$1,173,334 to \$931.967, and the 2018/2019 taxable value reduced from \$1,130,666 to \$935,819. Member Semmens seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-0-0.

F. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR NORTHERN NEVADA COMSTOCK INVESTMENTS LLC, 3344 NORTH CARSON STREET, APN 007-462-05.

(9:38:20) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Massow Presented the Assessor's Evidence, which is incorporated into the record, and recommended approval of the Stipulation Agreement. Chairperson Block inquired about the deed restriction and was informed that it was a condition of the sale of the property, which was recorded on April 11, 2017. The appellant was not present, and there were no public comments; therefore, Chairperson Block entertained a motion.

(9:36:50) – MOTION: Member Rasner moved to accept the value change stipulation agreement for APN 007-462-05, commonly known as 3344 North Carson Street, and to agree with the Assessor's Office recommendation of a taxable value reduction from \$763,503 to \$506,337. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. Motion carried 5-0-0.

G. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR VKDG DEVELOPMENT LLC, 3649 ARROWHEAD DRIVE, APN 005-053-05.

(9:43:28) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Member McFadden recused herself from discussion and vote due to a business partnership with the appellant. Ms. Gillott presented the Assessor's Evidence which is incorporated into the record and recommended approval of the Stipulation Agreement. Chairperson Block noted that the appellant was not present and that no public was present for public comment. He therefore entertained a motion.

(9:48:50) – MOTION: Member Wilson moved approve the value change stipulation for parcel number 005-053-05, which reduces the taxable value to \$761,564 for the 2017/2018 fiscal year, and to \$806,807 for the 2018/2019 fiscal year. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. The motion carried 4-0-1, with Member McFadden abstaining.

H. For Possible Action: REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STIPULATION AGREEMENT FOR BRUUN-ANDERSEN FAMILY ESTATE TRUST, 412 NORTH NEVADA STREET, APN 003-226-02.

(9:49:31) – Chairperson Block introduced the item. Mr. Saposnek presented the Assessor's Evidence and recommended approval of the taxable value stipulation agreement. Member Semmens inquired about the completion of the project, and believed "this thing is going to fall down before they get it done". Mr. Saposnek noted that "tearing it down is not an option" and indicated that the appellant had contacted a builder familiar with renovating historical properties, but had not received a call back. Mr. Dawley clarified that all properties that have received obsolescence have been placed on a list which get reviewed every year, including this property. Member Semmens was concerned about making the building structurally safe. Chairperson Block gave background on the property and the past renovation attempts for the past seven years, adding that it had been placed on the National Register of Historic Places. He also suggested postponing a vote on this item until hearing from the appellant. Mr. Dawley clarified that the Assessor's Office values properties on their current conditions, whether man made or affected by nature, and believed that the property was not usable and habitable now. Chairperson Block encouraged the owner to "do something" since the property was located on the historic Blue Line trail. There were no public comments. Chairperson Block entertained a motion. Ms. Fralick clarified that the Board may approve or change the stipulation; however, a changed stipulation would require agreement by the appellant. Member Rasner was informed that the appellant may be available by phone at the next meeting.

(10:03:32) – MOTION: Member Wilson moved to approve the value change stipulation for parcel number 003-226-02 with the following correction: functional obsolescence will be reduced from 90 percent to 70 percent, which will cause the taxable value for the structure to be \$23,739.30 for the 2018/2019 roll year; for a total taxable value of \$91,739.30 with the condition that the appellant agree to it. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens.

(10:04:09) – Mr. Dawley inquired about the basis for the reduction of the obsolescence percentage, and Member Wilson believed that a 90 percent functional obsolescence is extreme "because a lot of the value of this property comes from the fact that it is a historical property on the blue line and it looks acceptable from the exterior, and for that purpose it does look like it has that functional value." Ms. Fralick thanked Member Wilson for the clarification "because Staff takes all that into consideration [and] because they use an actual worksheet to come up with that number." Mr. Saposnek explained that the Assessor's Office looks at the property in the form of replacement cost, and believed that the historical nature of the property should not have an impact on its value, adding that they did not know if any of the components in the 10 percent value are even usable. Mr. Saposnek hoped that the foundation had some value; however he believed that the rest of the house has no value. Member Rasner indicated that the entire west side of Carson City had the same issue and was informed that the property was a foreclosure. Mr. Dawley noted that the obsolescence was temporary and was reviewed every year. Mr. Saposnek indicated that the land value could increase in the future. Chairperson Block explained that all demolition would require approval from the City's Historic Resources Commission. Member Wilson wished to clarify her statement on the historic value of the property and noted that the comment implied a market value from a historic perspective. There were no public comments and Chairperson Block called for the vote.

(10:14:14) – The motion carried 5-0-0. Ms. Fralick clarified that the stipulation agreement was amended; however, it required the approval of the appellant. Should the appellant disagree with the new agreement, the item will be reagendized.

I. For Possible Action: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF JVRS ENTERPRISES LLC, 1393 MEDICAL PARKWAY, APN 007-531-44.

This item was postponed to a later date.

J. For Possible Action: DISCUSSION AS TO THE DATE OF THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING, CURRENTLY SET FOR FEBRUARY 13, 2018.

(9:14:58) – Mr. Dawley proposed to have the next meeting on Feb 20, 2018 at 9 a.m.

K. PUBLIC COMMENT.

(10:15:33) – Chairperson Block entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming.

L. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: ADJOURNMENT

(10:15:52) – Member Rasner moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Member Semmens. The meeting was adjourned at 10:16 a.m.

The Minutes of the February 6, 2018 Carson City Board of Equalization meeting are so approved this 20th day of February, 2018.

| JED BLOCK, Chair | |
|------------------|--|